

National Workshop on Lessons Learned from Fisheries Co-Management 2000-2004



2-4 February, 2005

Department of Fisheries, Phnom Penh

Workshop Report

Introduction

The National Workshop on Lessons Learned from Fisheries Co-Management 2000-2004 was held at the Department of Fisheries, Phnom Penh, from 2-4 February 2005. It was jointly funded by the MRC MRRF (Management of River and Reservoir Fisheries), IDRC, and the Department of Fisheries¹.

Objectives of the workshop were:

1. To report on the community fisheries situation/activities and achievements in each target site from 2000-2004;
2. To provide an opportunity for grass roots community fisheries members from MRRF sites to share their own experiences on the process of community fisheries management and development from both river and reservoir sites;
3. To share and exchange knowledge, lessons learned and experiences and discuss the problems/constraints of community fisheries management and development.
4. To identify and develop recommendations for the appropriate solutions and strategies for sustainable community fisheries management and plans for 2005.

Participants were as follows:

No.	Organization/Positions	No. participants
1	Director and Deputy Directors of DoF	2
2	Chief , vice chief and staff of CFDO	10
3	Chiefs and CFDO of provincial Fisheries Offices in 22 provinces	44
4	Chief of offices at DoF (Exploitation, Domain& Extension, Aquaculture, Inspection, Contention and Planning offices)	6
5	CF Committee chiefs and members in MRRF and IDRC target sites (4people from each site)	30
6	Village chiefs in target sites	4
7	Commune chiefs	17
8	MRRF, AIMS (1), AMFC (1) + workshop facilitator, JICA, UNDP	10
9	NGOs	5
	Total	129

The agenda is given in Annex 1.

Opening Speech

In his opening speech, HE Nao Thuok, Director of the Department of Fisheries, explained the importance of organizing community fisheries following the fisheries reform. He pointed out that Cambodia's experience with community fisheries is still limited compared to other countries (just four years compared to decades in some cases).

¹ MRRF paid expenses for participants from the five project target provinces (Kompong Chhnang, Kompong Cham, Kandal, Phnom Penh, and Stung Treng), plus for materials for the workshop. IDRC paid expenses for participants from Banteay Meanchey, Takeo, and Koh Kong. The DoF paid expenses for participants from all 14 other provinces.

He also encouraged all participants to participate actively in the workshop in order to contribute to identifying good methods and experiences for community fisheries development.

Presentations on Lessons Learned for Fisheries Co-Management

Most of the first day was spent on presentations on community fisheries initiatives in different provinces, including the five where MRRF is active (Kompong Cham, Kandal, Kompong Chhnang, Stung Treng, and Phnom Penh), one where IDRC is supporting activities (Banteay Meanchey), and two others (Siem Reap and Battambang). In addition, there was a presentation on Research Guidelines for CF Establishment by an officer of CFDO. These presentations are given in Annexes 2-10.

In the case of the five provinces where MRRF is active, a community fisheries representative, the MRRF facilitator, and a provincial Fisheries officer all gave presentations. In the case of Banteay Meanchey, a community fisheries representative and provincial Fisheries officer both gave presentations, and in the cases of the other two provinces, provincial Fisheries officers gave presentations.

Following each presentation there was feedback from the Director and Deputy Director of the DoF, as well as questions from participants.

Kompong Chhnang

Mr. Chhim Chhoeun, chief of the CF committee in Kanleng Phe Village, and chief of the committee of the CF federation covering the area of former Fishing Lot #13 in Kompong Chhnang Province, talked about experiences facilitating village meetings, organizing regular patrols, and information sharing with CF committee members, patrol team members and CF members. His community had reached agreement among themselves to operate a large scale fishing operation, and used the income from the operation to pay for community development projects, including repair of a school and construction of a ceremonial hall, village roads, pagoda fences, etc. They did this despite the fact that it was not entirely legal, but they had the support of all community members (evidenced by thumbprints). He felt that this was a positive experience and the community would continue to do the same in the future.

HE Nao Thuok responded that the large scale fishing operation was a good experience for Kompong Chhnang, but communities should not decide what to do on the basis simply of agreement among all villagers (when something is contrary to the law, such as the barrage operation). He expressed concern over the use of barrages, and said also that the CF should not use its income for anything other than CF activities – should not, for example, fund community construction projects or pay for community contributions to SEILA projects. And all community members should take turns patrolling so that there is no need to compensate the patrol teams. He also suggested that the CFs collect small contributions from members. In response to the CF representative's request for rights to arrest violators, he said that CFs already have adequate rights: they can arrest violators and send them directly to Fisheries officers (but they cannot charge fines by themselves).

In response to the presentation by the facilitator, HE Nao Thuok also said that there is confusion between management plans and action plans. In many cases what is presented as a management plan is actually just an action plan. In response to a comment from another participant (requesting that the raising of snakeheads be terminated once and for all) he said that starting in May, no raising of snakeheads will be tolerated and if there are any violations, people should call him immediately.

Kompong Cham

Mr. Sok Thol, chief of the farmers' water use and fisheries association in Chroy Cheik Reservoir, in Kompong Cham Province, reported that his CF association was established in 2001 through facilitation by PRASAC, focusing on the use of water. Later, the MRC Reservoir Fisheries project facilitated the introduction of community fisheries development and established an integrated community development project that included cattle banks and provision of fish seed, in cooperation with local authorities.

Phnom Penh

Mr. Sok Thai, chief of the CF federation in Boeng Choeng Ek lake in Phnom Penh, reported that the CF was established after the cancellation of fishing lot #1. A total of 885 families live in the villages around the lake. Fisheries officers raised awareness in all the villages about community fisheries, and small groups were organized. Group representatives drafted by-laws, and elections were held for chiefs and deputy chiefs of CF committees in all villages. One chief was also elected for the federation, covering nine communes.

In 2001, the catch was less than the previous year because of bad seasonal conditions, but the next year people could catch about 1-2 million riels worth of fish per family. Fishing can thus contribute to poverty reduction. However, there are now lots of outsiders, from Koh Thom District (Kandal), Kompong Speu Province, etc. and people catch less fish than before. About 400 families have started planting *kanchet* (an edible water plant), and others have started planting beans or other crops, or started *moto dup* businesses. The CF wants help in establishing two conservation areas, and they would not cost much to set up. The CF requests signs to demarcate the conservation areas, and the community will make set up fish habitats.

The CF representative said that if villagers understand community fisheries and feel a sense of ownership, then the CF will be successful, but otherwise, not even the police can stop illegal activities.

For the past four years there has been no project or NGO support for this CF, but the community made wells and built two roads to help fishers get to the lake.

Mr. Non Sophy, deputy director of the Phnom Penh Fisheries Office, said that the Boeng Cheung Ek lake is too big to manage as a single unit, and he wants to divide it into smaller pieces for management. He has already made a request to the facilitator to do this. In the past five months, the facilitator has organized elections and drafting of by-laws; the by-laws still need signatures of commune chiefs.

Mr. Non Sophy also reported that another CF has been established in Phnom Penh, along Preik Ta Seik, involving four villages. Because the villages are far apart, he wants to make four different community fisheries, linked in a federation. There are a lot of illegal activities in the CF areas, including electrofishing (mostly at night) and use of mosquito net gears. It is difficult to stop electrofishers because they can easily slip away to nearby houses. It is difficult to eliminate mosquito net gears because they are so inexpensive. An effective way to deal with offenders is to collect their names, then invite them for “education” about Declaration 02 on electrofishing and use of mosquito net gears. Another problem is the buying of land around the Choeng Ek lake, always with the backing of powerful people. Finally, he requested that MRRF and other organizations continue to support the CF.

The names of land buyers have been collected and reported to the municipal Department of Agriculture, but there has been no response yet.

In response, Mr. Long Chheang, Deputy Director of DoF, asked that MRRF examine the possibility of continuing support for the CF initiative; Mr. Chhuon Kim Chhea, Deputy Director of CFDO² said that the project would continue its support through Phase II of the project. He also said that in the past there has not been good cooperation with the Department of Land Management, which has issued titles for land around the lake. He asked Mr. Uk Vibol of the Fisheries Domain Office to help demarcate the boundaries of the CF to prevent land sales; he replied that DoF has made a letter to the municipal Department of Land Management but didn’t know if they had acted on it yet.

Mr. Uk Vibol also noted that in the lake, there are almost no native fish – almost all are tilapia.

Stung Treng

Mr. Loeuk Wat, representative of the community fisheries in Choam Thom Village, Koh Sneng Commune, Thalla Barivat District, Stung Treng, reported that his CF was organized in 2000 by CAA. Since then, the situation has improved. Before, there was electrofishing and fishing with explosives. There has been a lot of awareness raising among villagers, and they patrol 2-3 times a month together with local authorities. Illegal activities have decreased. In 2003, people who used electrofishing gears were “educated” and one or two batteries were handed in.

This year, someone has used explosives. The offender said, “There is a drought this year, and I have nothing to eat.”

Mr. Chan Samon, chief of the Stung Treng Fisheries Office, confirmed what the facilitator said in his presentation, that community fisheries were first organized in Stung Treng in 1997, in Siem Bok District, and expanded to Thalla Bariwat District (including Choam Thom) in 2000. He identified the following difficulties encountered in CF development in the province:

- CFs have been organized in too many different places, and some of them don’t function.

² Community Fisheries Development Office

- There is poor cooperation between the CFs and the Fisheries Office; the office is too far from the communities, and there are too few staff.
- When Fisheries officers raised awareness about the Fisheries Law, illegal activities reduced. However, explosives and electrofishing are still used. Illegal fishers have numerous tricks. For example, they use explosives, and let villagers collect the fish. Most illegal fishers have connections to military or police.
- Fisheries officers cannot be stationed near the Lao border, only near the provincial center. There are lots of rivers in the province, and few officers.

In response to these presentations, Mr. Long Chheang said that police should participate in awareness raising activities since police are fishing with explosives. He also said that a royal decree will be issued to protect dolphins in both Kratie and Stung Treng, and is now at the Council of Ministers. The Government has stopped two export companies that used to export fish to Laos; people used to use explosives and electrofishing to supply these companies.

Mr. Long Chheang said that it is important to find out who in each village is using illegal gears, and educate them so that they will hand them in. If they don't listen, Fisheries officers can get a court order to check their homes. Still, before using "hot" means, education should be the first step. Illegal fishers need to understand that their actions affect everyone.

Siem Reap

Following the presentation of Mr. Prin Savin, from the Siem Reap Fisheries Office, Mr. Long Chheang asked for clarification of the request for training, and the documents supposedly lacking. Mr. Chhuon Kim Chhea noted that Siem Reap is one of the provinces targeted by the ADB Tonle Sap community fisheries project, so there will be plenty of opportunities for training. Mr. Prin Savin requested magazines and other documents related to organization of community fisheries; Mr. Chhuon Kim Chhea said he would distribute any relevant documents to the provinces.

Mr. Long Chheang asked for clarification on clearing of flooded forest in Bakong District, and Mr. Prin Savin said the clearing has almost reached the Tonle Sap. He plans to organize community fisheries in this district using funds from SEILA.

In summary, Mr. Long Chheang said that Siem Reap has had lots of good experiences and other provinces should learn from them.

Battambang

Mr. Hong Hy gave a presentation on community fisheries in ***Battambang*** Province. He said that if villagers call other villagers to meetings, few people come. However, if meetings are held at the provincial level, everyone comes – because they get DSA.

He said that in Battambang, some communities have income that they use for construction activities. Some community fisheries collect fees from outsiders or fines. When CFs rely on fines for income it means they need to have illegal activities in order to generate income. He said also that sometimes NGOs train CFs in accounting, but there has been no follow up.

Community fisheries associations say that in the dry season all the fish leave, and swim into the fishing lots.

Mr. Hong Hy said that CFs need to have conservation areas. Two conservation areas are being established, but the Cambodian NGOs who are helping don't have funds to pay for boundary markers. ADB will help with this.

The CFs are very active, and patrol teams spend nights in the flooded forest. If they call provincial Fisheries to help, they have to respond. Mosquito net gears are almost eliminated in the province, but there are still some brush traps operated with the protection of armed forces.

This year, he said, some CFs have done what the CFs in Kompong Chhnang have: used their funds to pay for construction projects.

Some NGOs, he said, lack experience in building the capacity of CFs. One NGO (Lucaena) claims that the existing Fisheries Law is too old and can't be used. It wants 90% of money from fines to go to the CF. When asked how CFs collected money from fines, Mr. Hong Hy responded that before the Fisheries reform, Lucaena organized 7 CFs, with official recognition from the provincial Governor. 50% of fines went to the CF, 40% to other officers who helped make the arrest, and 10% to Fisheries officers to help write the report. Later by-laws have 50% of fine money going to the state, 20% to the CF, and 5% to Fisheries officers who help write the report. In response to a question, he said that the CFs set fines extraordinarily high, such as 10 million riels; they never collect the full amount and negotiate with the offender over how much to collect. Mr. Long Chheang noted that the old Fisheries Law is still valid. 50% of fine money is supposed to go to those who help make the arrest. And he said that CFs should find ways other than large scale fishing operations and collecting fines to generate income.

Mr. Hong Hy reported that the following problems are encountered:

- NGOs do things themselves (such as organize meetings) rather than letting CFs develop a sense of ownership.
- There need to be projects to help with livelihoods (such as credit provision)
- A new kind of gear, "*bo chap trey kamphleanh*", similar to an arrow net but with small mesh, is being used.

Banteay Meanchey

Mr. Nouv Leang, deputy chief of CFDU of Banteay Meanchey Province, reported that CFs have been established in 66 villages in three districts. Nine CFs have draft by-laws. The provincial Fisheries Office has worked together with VSG since late 2002, UNDP since late 2003, and IDRC since mi-2003.

He reported that CF members believe in the fisheries reform and support their CFs. The CFs have good relations with the other CFs in the province and in other provinces, with Fisheries officers, with local authorities, and with NGOs. There is good solidarity among CF committees and they participate in protecting the resources. They have received training, participated in exposure visits, and participated in meetings of village, commune, and district networks.

Some CFs have had problems and re-elections have had to be held.

CFs have put up signs forbidding the use of electrofishing and mosquito net gears along major roads. Ten conservation areas have been set up, and five of them (in the Phneat-Koh Pong Sat CF) have committees to protect them. Six signs have been put up around the conservation areas in the Phneat-Koh Pong Sat CF.

The CFs have stopped illegal activities a total of 180 times. They have collected and destroyed electrofishing and mosquito net gears, torn down barrages and removed brush traps, and stopped people pumping ponds.

In the future, the Banteay Meanchey Fisheries Office will continue to organize community fisheries, in cooperation with partners. One CF will be organized in Phnom Srok District, and another in Preah Net Preah. It will help set up conservation areas in all CFs, and help them stop illegal fishing.

The chief of the CF in Phneat-Koh Pong Sat reported that her CF was established in 2001 following the fisheries reform. There are sub-committees in all eleven villages, and commune-level committees were elected in September that year. One of the deputy directors of the Department of Fisheries participated in the elections. The commune councils, police, and CF sub-committees protect the conservation pools in the river. Two of the conservation pools were established by the community itself, together with monks. The CF has encouraged illegal fishers to hand in electrofishing gear to the authorities, and also seized illegal gears in cooperation with police and local authorities. A total of 55 electrofishing gears have been collected.

Group Discussions

On the second day, participants divided into groups for group discussions. CF committees, commune chiefs, and Fisheries officers all participated in groups together, by province or region. Groups were as follows:

- Group 1: all participants from Kompong Chhnang Province
- Group 2: all participants from Kompong Cham Province
- Group 3: all participants from Kandal Province
- Group 4: all participants from Stung Treng Province
- Group 5: all participants from Phnom Penh Municipality
- Group 6: all participants from the Mekong area (other than Kompong Cham, Kandal, Stung Treng, and Phnom Penh)
- Group 7: all participants from the coastal zone
- Group 8: all participants from the Tonle Sap (other than Kompong Chhnang)

Discussion questions are given in Annex 11. Questions covered four main themes:

1. **Past experiences and recommendations**, focusing on lessons learned from experience (as compared to theory).
2. **Monitoring and evaluation**, focusing on developing indicators and finding ways to measure them.
3. **Impacts of CF initiatives** to date.
4. **Planning for the future**, focusing on addressing problems currently being faced.

There was quite a bit of confusion about the questions. A number of concepts were not familiar to people:

- “Experiences” or “lessons learned”: people tended to substitute “past activities”
- “Impacts”
- “Indicators”

Unfortunately, because of the way questions were asked, discussion under topic four did not really link back to lessons learned that were identified under top one. This meant a missed opportunity to incorporate those lessons in planning. Participants also focused more on mechanical aspects of planning (identifying the time frame for implementation or resources needed) than thinking about ways to improve the work.

Groups presented back to the plenary on Day 3. The results of each discussion group are given in Annexes 12 to 19, and they are summarized below.

1. **Past experiences and recommendations:** Participants discussed positive and negative experiences and gave recommendations for other provinces as well as for their own work in the future.

Experiences:

- **Barrage fishing operations:** In *Kompong Chhnang*, with the elimination of the fishing lots and barrages across channels connecting floodplain ponds to the

river, the ponds drained more quickly so people lacked water their dry season ricefields. Fish also all swam out of the ponds into the river without being caught. The communities decided to set up barrages at these sites for a two month period to generate income for community construction projects and to catch fish that otherwise would have left the CF area, for villagers to eat or make *prahok*. In some communities this worked out successfully, in others it led to conflict because the CF committees had not adequately informed all community members in advance. Community members who had their own large scale gears they wanted to use, and some illegal fishers, didn't approve of the operations. In *Phnom Penh* municipality, the CF also operated a barrage after a majority of members approved. Members can still fish freely according to the CF regulations. Income from the barrage operation has been used to pay for patrolling, construction of two roads, digging of three wells, and house construction for one destitute family. This has been a positive experience, because it has been possible to generate income for the CF and otherwise the fish will all swim out of the CF. In the *Mekong area*, CFs have operated bagnets for river lobsters and barrages. As a result they have been able to generate income to pay for road and dike construction and buy land for construction of a commune office. They have been able to catch fish to make *prahok* and most villagers are supportive. However, in some places there has been conflict related to competition over fishing sites or division of benefits, plus the sub-decree does not allow these large-scale operations. **Recommendations:**

- CFs should set up groups to operate barrage operations in the recession season. Before operating such large scale operations, the CF committee needs to adequately inform all community members and the timing and dimensions of the gear need to be clearly specified. CFs should get permission from DoF for these operations. (Kompong Chhnang)
 - CFs should be allowed to operate large scale fishing operations in part of the CF area for the benefit of the community and local villagers, with the support of Fisheries officials. (Mekong area)
- **Cooperation with Fisheries officials and local authorities:** In *Kompong Chhnang*, in the past, there was little support for CFs from local authorities because the CFs didn't make enough effort to meet them, the CFs didn't understand their own roles and responsibilities, community fisheries was a new concept for villagers, and there was inadequate participation by villagers. Now there is good communication and cooperation with local authorities and Fisheries officials, CFs understand their roles, and there is participation and support by villagers. In *Stung Treng*, the CF reports names of illegal fishers to the police and commune and district authorities; commune police then call the illegal fishers, give them warnings, and make them turn in their illegal gears. Sometimes, however, police just take payoffs from illegal fishers. In *Phnom Penh*, in stopping illegal activities the CF has always worked closely with Fisheries officials, commune authorities, and commune police. This has worked out well because there are commune police stationed all around the lake. In the *Mekong area*, some CFs have stopped illegal activities without working together with Fisheries officials. On the positive side they have been able to stop the violations in time, but sometimes the violators have filed suits against the CF, there have been conflicts, and violators have carried a grudge against the CF.

Recommendations:

- CFs should work together with Fisheries officials, local authorities, relevant institutions, and NGOs. There needs to be transparency (in all activities in the CF there needs to be consultation with villagers). (Kompong Chhnang)
 - CFs should work closely together with Fisheries officials and local authorities. (Mekong area)
- **Organizing small groups:** In *Phnom Penh*, a total of 88 groups, each with 10 members, were organized. Organization of these groups made it easier to manage the CF.
- **Establishing women’s groups:** In *Kompong Chhnang*, Women’s groups have been established in many of the villages. **Recommendations:**
- Every CF should have active participation by women. (Kompong Chhnang)
- **Suppressing illegal activities:** In *Kompong Chhnang*, many of the CFs have regular patrol activities. In *Kompong Cham*, the CFs have worked together with local authorities to “educate” violators, and illegal fishing in the reservoirs has decreased. In *Kandal*, the CF tried working together with a large number of officials to suppress illegal activities, but were unsuccessful as the illegal fishers were themselves armed. The CF later changed tactics, to holding meetings in villages among the CF, illegal fishers, and authorities, and this has been successful. In *Kandal*, also, the CF borrowed a boat to use in stopping illegal fishers, and they destroyed the boat. In *Stung Treng*, the CF finds illegal fishers by sending other people to go out fishing with them (“undercover”). In *Phnom Penh*, suppression of illegal activities has not been very effective because the CF hasn’t done enough to educate people about illegal activities. Electrofishing and use of mosquito net gear continue. In the *Mekong* area, CFs together with local authorities have suppressed illegal activities and brought the illegal gear to Fisheries officers. They have succeeded in seizing evidence, and the violators don’t dare file suits against the CF. Illegal activities have decreased and CFs have received rewards. However, sometimes the illegal fishers threaten the CF. In the Mekong area, also, networks within communities have been established to report on illegal activities. There has been good support for this from Fisheries officials, CF members, and local authorities, and it has been possible to identify illegal fishers. However, some members of the network inform the illegal fishers. In the *Tonle Sap* region, there is active participation by the CF in stopping illegal activities, and they have a good understanding of the law. There is good cooperation from all institutions and provincial authorities have issued orders to stop illegal activities. Suppression of illegal activities has been helped by the participation of women, and there are networks to provide information. However, CFs lack means of transport, and they fear for their security. Local authorities have allowed companies to clear flooded forest for agriculture. Powerful people provide protection for illegal activities, and suppression activities sometimes are not fast enough to stop the illegal activities. **Recommendations:**
- CF members need to monitor and report on all activities of illegal fishers (Kompong Chhnang).
 - CFs should work together with local authorities to “educate” violators (Kompong Cham).
 - There should be widespread dissemination of the Fisheries Law and CF regulations (Phnom Penh).

- There should be rewards for CFs that stop many illegal activities. A network to stop illegal activities should be organized in each CF. (Mekong area)
 - Encouragement, legal support, and means of transport should be provided to CFs. CFs should cooperate with Fisheries officers, and Fisheries officers should be based in CF. People involved in illegal activities should be arrested and punished (Tonle Sap area)
- **Establishing cow banks:** In *Kompong Cham*, establishing cow banks has helped to provide encouragement to villagers to participate in the CF, has increased income generating options for CF members, and has helped to reduce fishing. **Recommendations:**
 - Other CFs should establish cow banks. (Kompong Cham)
 - **Establishing rice banks:** In *Kompong Cham*, establishing rice banks has created an income source for the CF, has provided encouragement to villagers to participate in the CF, and has contributed to improving the living situation of villagers. **Recommendations:**
 - Other CFs should establish rice banks. (Kompong Cham)
 - **Putting up signs:** In *Kandal*, signs telling people not to fish illegally have been put up in areas near where illegal fishers live. In practice this has led to decreased illegal fishing, but some signs have been stolen. Therefore they should be put up at someone's house and that person made responsibility for the signs. In the *Tonle Sap* region, signs have been put up around CF boundaries.
 - **Visitors books:** In *Kandal*, some CFs have visitors books for visitors to sign. Visitors have contributed money and the CF has been able to collect enough to build an office for itself.
 - **Educating, awareness raising, and capacity building:** In *Stung Treng*, the CF educated villagers about the Fisheries Law. Whenever there is a meeting in the village or commune, CF committee members participate and talk about CF activities. In the *Mekong* area, there has been dissemination of Declaration 02 and other relevant pieces of legislation. As a result, some villagers understand and have handed in their electrofishing gear to local authorities. However, dissemination hasn't been widespread yet, and electrofishing and use of mosquito net gears continues. CF committees have participated in workshops and exposure visits, and have gained knowledge and experience. But only a small number of people have participated and they haven't shared what they learned with others. In the *Tonle Sap* region, awareness has been raised through the use of video, radio, and pictures and in pagodas. Some signs have fallen down. CF members have skills in facilitating and dare to speak up and give their opinions. However participation in trainings is still limited, understanding of villagers is still limited, and there is a lack of funds and means of transport for awareness raising activities. **Recommendations:**
 - All members of CF committees should have the opportunity to participate in exposure visits and workshops. Dissemination should be widespread and use all means (Mekong area)

- Additional study tours should be organized, and additional training should be given, associated with actual practice and monitoring and evaluation. There should be ongoing awareness raising activities, and there needs to be adequate means of transport and funds. (Tonle Sap region)
- **Communication with commune councils:** In *Stung Treng*, CF committees participate in all meetings of the commune councils.
- **Networking:** In *Stung Treng*, commune network meetings are held every three months.
- **Collection of membership fees:** In *Phnom Penh*, the CF has never collected membership fees. The result is that the CF doesn't have enough funds.
- **Fishers from outside the CF:** The CF in *Stung Treng* used to collect fees from fishers from outside, and issue receipts to them. In *Phnom Penh*, there are a lot of fishers from outside fishing in the CF area using a variety of legal and illegal gears. **Recommendation:**
 - CFs should not collect fees from outside users. (Stung Treng)
 - The CF should collect fees from outsiders who fish in the CF area, and they should obey the CF regulations (Phnom Penh).
- **Collecting fees from fish buyers:** A CF in the *Mekong* area (in Ratanakiri) had, together with local authorities, charged fees of fish buyers. This allowed them to generate income for the CF, but it led to the CF colluding with buyers in transporting rare species. **Recommendation:**
 - The strictest measures must be taken against people who transport rare species. (Mekong area)
- **Establishing conservation areas:** In the *Mekong* area, CFs have established conservation areas and this means that broodstock have habitat. However, people have poached in the conservation areas. In the *Tonle Sap* region, most CFs have conservation areas, and logs are put in the conservation areas and signs put up. The location of the conservation areas must be properly selected. One problem is that the conservation areas are not yet officially recognized; also, some villagers don't support the establishment of conservation areas, the process of establishing them isn't satisfactory yet, and outsiders cause problems. **Recommendations:**
 - Patrol posts should be set up at the conservation areas. One conservation area should be established in each CF (Mekong area).
 - Additional conservation areas should be established, and legal documents authorizing conservation areas should be prepared. There needs to be awareness raising about the conservation areas and signs set up (Tonle Sap region).
- **Making CF regulations:** In the *Mekong* area, CFs have developed regulations, but they aren't officially recognized yet. **Recommendations:**
 - The CF sub-decree should be passed quickly. (Mekong area)

- **Participation:** In the *Tonle Sap* region, there is good participation in CF activities in terms of both labor and materials, villagers understand the benefits of CFs, and there is support from local authorities. However, there haven't been activities related to gender, and some CF committee members fear for their own security and have difficulty just making a living. **Recommendations:**
 - There needs to be additional awareness raising activities, and CF committees should receive encouragement and legal backup (Tonle Sap region).
- **CF finances:** In the *Tonle Sap* area, CFs have generated income from collection of fines, donations, and tourism. They have used their income to pay for projects in their communities. This has increased interest among villagers in participating in CF activities. Proper bookkeeping systems have been set up. However, sometimes CFs derive income in ways that are not technically appropriate and the result is bad impacts on the resources. The desire to generate income through fines also leads to increased illegal activities. CFs don't have adequate funds for their own management. **Recommendations:**
 - Illegal activities should be punished by severe penalties, according to the new Fisheries law. CF by-laws should specify payment of contributions by members and outsiders. And the DoF should help to attract donors and other support (Tonle Sap region).
- **Sharing experiences:** In the *Tonle Sap* region, people have learned from other experiences through exposure visits and workshops. However, some people don't share with others what they learn, some don't speak up in the workshops, and some don't use what they learn. **Recommendations:**
 - There should be plans for further sharing of experiences. Workshop facilitators have to create an environment in which everyone can speak up (Tonle Sap region)

In addition, the following recommendations were given, but their direct relationship to specific experiences was not mentioned:

- CF committees should have **meetings** once a month (Kompong Cham)
- CFs should **disseminate** declaration 02 of the Prime Minister (Kompong Cham). The Fisheries Law, CF by-laws and regulations, and other laws should be disseminated widely throughout the province. (Stung Treng)
- CFs should show the **video** on CF produced by the DoF to villagers (Kompong Cham).
- CFs should **mobilize villagers** to join the CF (Kompong Cham)
- CFs should work together with Fisheries officials and local authorities in **stopping illegal activities**. (Kompong Cham) Whenever CFs seize illegal gears, they must immediately report it to Fisheries officers and bring the gears to them. (Mekong area) **Patrol teams** should be appointed to patrol regularly (Kandal). CFs should collect the names of illegal fishers, and **educate** them at the commune office (Kompong Cham)
- Fisheries officers, local authorities, NGOs, and other relevant institutions should all contribute to the effective functioning of community fisheries. The management and leadership **capacities** of community fisheries should be built. (coastal zone).

- CFs should **raise awareness** among members of the importance of fish. (Kompong Cham)
- CF committees should receive training on **fish breeding** and fish raising, and teach CF members how to raise fish. (Kompong Cham)
- CFs should have **conservation areas** with clearly defined areas and locations. (Kandal) A district level workshop should be organized about the conservation areas, and the CF will put up signs around conservation areas. (Stung Treng)
- There should be clear maps and **boundary** markers to delineate CF areas to facilitate management (coastal zone).
- Local authorities and Fisheries officials need to **help to resolve all kinds of problems** in CFs when CFs ask for help. (Mekong area)
- There should be integrated **community development activities** (Mekong area). Development activities would help to increase incomes and reduce fishing (Coastal zone).
- **Money, equipment, and means of transport** should be provided, and partners found for CF development (Mekong area).
- The **sub-decree** on community fisheries should be passed so that community fisheries can operate effectively (coastal zone).

2. **Monitoring and evaluation:**

Participants developed **indicators** for monitoring impact of CF development activities and specified how they would be measured.

- **Support from Fisheries officers, local authorities, and relevant institutions:** This support will be monitored by whether or not these people help out or participate when communities call upon them. (Kompong Chhnang)
- **Increases in fish:** Increases in fish will be monitored based on families' income from fishing during the peak eight day period (*knaoet*); the number of families smoking fish; and sightings of young *trey pra* and *trey koalreang*. Catch of *trey chhma*, *trey krpoat*, *trey ros*, and *trey chdao* by villagers and their sale in the market will also be monitored. (Kompong Chhnang) 10% of fishers will keep records of their catch (Kompong Cham). Three times a month, people who fish in the CF ponds will be interviewed about their fish catch, and patrol teams will keep books to record the fish that they themselves catch every day. (Kandal) Records will be kept of fish migrations (Stung Treng). Increase in fish catch will be measured using monthly records of fish catch (Phnom Penh). Fish catches will be monitored using questionnaires for fishers (Mekong area). Decreases in fish catches will be monitored through reports by Fisheries officers, fishers, and fish buyers. For example, 10% of fishers could regularly record their catches (coastal zone). Fish catches will be monitored by Fisheries officers using log books to record catches of different species. (Tonle Sap region)
- **Fisheries resources:** Increases in fisheries resources will be monitored through resource inventories (Mekong area).
- **Reduction in illegal activities:** Reduction in illegal activities will be monitored based on reduction in mosquito net fishing gears (Kompong Chhnang). Statistics will be collected on electrofishing gears every two months (Kompong Cham). Every month the CF will collect statistics on the number of electrofishing gears and mosquito net gears in each village (Kandal). Record books of illegal activities will be kept (Stung Treng). Reduction in use of illegal gears will be monitored through monthly statistics of the number of illegal gears in each village

(Phnom Penh). The number of illegal gears will be monitored by village chiefs and CFs collecting statistics on the number in each village every month (Mekong area). Reduction in the number of illegal gears will be monitored through monthly reports by the CF committees and by reports by patrol teams when they return from patrols (coastal zone). Increases or decreases in the number of illegal activities within a given time period will be monitored by Fisheries officers (Tonle Sap region).

- **Fishing gears:** Fishing gears will be monitored (Kompong Cham).
- **Community participation:** Community participation will be monitored based on the number of people who participate in meetings and who speak up (Kompong Chhnang) and on statistics on fishers and CF members (Kompong Cham). Membership in the CFs will be monitored using application forms for membership and tables of active members (Kandal). The number of people who participate in the CF will be monitored through attendance lists of meetings, and increases in membership in the CF will be monitored using lists of members. (Phnom Penh). Increase or decrease in membership in the CF will be monitored based on requests to join the CFs and lists of members, the number of active members will be monitored based on payment of membership fees, and the number of people who participate in suppressing illegal activities will be monitored based on attendance lists during enforcement activities. (Mekong area). Membership in CFs will be monitored through requests to join and leave the CF and monthly statistics of the CF committees (coastal zone). Participation by villagers in CF activities will be monitored based on the number of CF members who participate in each meeting or other activity and on lists of members who have paid membership fees. (Tonle Sap region)
- **Participation of women:** This will be monitored based on participation of women in CF activities and their ability to speak up. (Kompong Chhnang)
- **Interest by outsiders:** Interest by outsiders in the CF will be monitored based on visits by domestic and international visitors. (Kompong Chhnang)
- **Capacity of CF committees:** The capacity of CF committees will be monitored based on their ability to hold meetings on their own (Kompong Cham) and the confidence of CF committees to express their opinions, and their ability to organize meetings on their own (Kandal). Capacity of CF committees will be monitored based on their ability to write reports and minutes, develop plans, and set up agendas for meetings (coastal zone). The level of understanding of villagers will be monitored by Fisheries officers, CF committees, and NGOs based on the number of people who participate in CF activities and the number who speak up, based on minutes of meetings. (Tonle Sap region)
- **Increase in capital of CF:** This will be monitored base on rice banks and cow banks (Kompong Cham). The funds of CFs will be monitored based on income and expenditures (Mekong area).
- **Increase in area of flooded forest:** Increase in area of flooded forest will be monitored (Kompong Cham). Increase in mangrove forests will be monitored though reports and direct observations (coastal zone).
- **Community solidarity:** Community solidarity will be monitored. (Kompong Cham)
- **Community activity:** The overall level of activity of the CF will be monitored using monthly and annual reports, meeting minutes, and reports of patrol activities and other activities (Phnom Penh).

- **Family income:** Family income will be monitored by Fisheries officers and NGOs based on household assets, styles of housing, the number of children in school, and possession of jewelry. (Tonle Sap region)
- **Health and sanitation:** Health and sanitation will be monitored by Fisheries officers and NGOs based on the number of sick people. (Tonle Sap region)
- **Increases in fish price:** Fish prices will be recorded every month (Phnom Penh).
- **Decreases in conflict:** Decreases in conflict will be measured by looking at the number of complaints filed in the community. (Phnom Penh) Conflict will be monitored through reports of the CF committees and commune councils (coastal zone).
- **Increase in number of fishers:** Will be measured by recording the estimated number of fishers (Phnom Penh).

Participants also determined what documentation they would use to **monitor implementation** of activities:

- Reports (Kompong Chhnang); activities reports (Kompong Cham)
- Meeting minutes and attendance lists (Kompong Chhnang)
- Reports of patrol activities (Kompong Chhnang)
- Monthly and annual reports (Kompong Chhnang)
- CF member IDs (Kompong Cham)
- Maps of CFs (Kompong Cham)
- Resource inventories (Kompong Cham)

3. Impacts of CF initiatives: Participants determined what impacts CF development activities had had thus far.

Impacts on skills and capacities

- The level of **understanding** of CF committees has increased (coastal zone).
- Community members now dare **express their opinions** (Kompong Chhnang). CF committees are more confident than before. They are able to stand up in front of a big workshop, and dare to “educate” illegal fishers at their homes. (Kandal) CF leaders dare to express their opinions. (Stung Treng) CF committees dare to speak out. (Mekong area) CF members dare to express their opinions (Tonle Sap region).
- Community leaders **can organize meetings** by themselves (Kompong Chhnang)
- Community members **understand the value of the resources:** community leaders have bought pythons, turtles, and rare fish species others have caught and released them. (Kompong Chhnang) CF members understand the importance of Fisheries resources (Stung Treng). Most CF members understand the importance of fisheries resources and community fisheries (Mekong area). CF members understand the importance of fisheries resources (coastal zone).
- **Solidarity** has increased: communities have collected money to help people whose houses were destroyed (Kompong Chhnang)
- **Relations** with Fisheries officials, local authorities, and other relevant institutions are improved: there is cooperation in stopping illegal activities (Kompong Chhnang) There is good cooperation (Tonle Sap region).
- CF leaders are able to **collect information** (Kompong Cham)

- CF leaders are able to **resolve conflicts** with officials and authorities (Kompong Cham). CF committees are able to resolve problems and conflicts (Mekong area)
- Community leaders are able to **write proposals** (Kompong Chhnang). CF committees are able to write **monthly reports** to provincial Fisheries officers and to the project (Kandal). Community leaders are able to write reports and **minutes** (Kompong Chhnang, Kompong Cham). CF committees know how to make reports, minutes, and requests (Mekong area). CFs are able to prepare **plans** (Tonle Sap region).
- CF members **understand the law** (Kompong Cham). CF members have a good understanding of the law and the benefits of CF management (Tonle Sap region).
- CF leaders have some understanding of **accounting** (Kompong Cham)
- CF leaders have an understanding of **CF development** and the Fisheries Law, and are able to make plans for implementation in the CF. (Stung Treng)
- CF members have an understanding of the **fisheries reform** that included the complete cancellation of Lot #1. People who used to catch young fish as they swam into the lake in the closed season have stopped doing so, because they understand that the fishing grounds belong to them. (Phnom Penh).
- CF members understand the CF **regulations**, particularly the gears that are allowed by the regulations. Most CF members fish at family scale. (Phnom Penh)
- The CF committees understand that CF development is for the benefit of everyone in the community. They are willing to **give up their own time** for CF activities. (Phnom Penh).
- CF committees know how to **manage** activities (Mekong area)
- CF committees know how to **communicate** with other people, **lead**, and **facilitate** meetings. (Mekong area)
- CF members understand **gender** (Mekong area)

Impacts on resources and their management

- **Flooded forest** continues to be destroyed through clearing of land for farming and residence (Kompong Chhnang). Flooded forest has decreased by about 80%. When businessmen buy land around the CF area they always clear the flooded forest. They also dig earth to sell. (Phnom Penh) Cutting of flooded forest has reduced (Mekong area)
- **Fish populations** have increased: fish catches have increased. (Kompong Chhnang) Some fish species have increased, including chhpin, k'ek, kahae, and andeng (Kompong Cham). Fish catch has increased (Kompong Cham) Fish stocks have increased (Stung Treng). Fish stocks have increased. Since the CF was established the number of people fishing has increased but they can all catch the same amount of fish as they used to. (Phnom Penh) Fish stocks have increased (Mekong area). Fisheries resources have increased (coastal zone). Fish populations have increased in Banteay Meanchey.
- **Illegal activities** have reduced (Kompong Cham). Electrofishers have switched occupations to moto dup driver, construction, and farming. (Kandal) Illegal fishing has decreased (Stung Treng). Illegal activities have decreased (coastal zone).
- CF members have good solidarity in **suppressing illegal activities**. They removed 10 brush traps in the reservoir, seized thirty gillnets in the conservation area, and arrested two groups of people using castnets in the conservation area (a total of two boats and four people). (Kandal) CFs help to stop illegal activities (Tonle Sap region).

- **Fishing gears** and **fishers** have increased (Stung Treng, Tonle Sap region) The number of fishers has increased (Mekong area)
- The number of **CF members** has increased (Stung Treng).
- People can **plant** more *trakuon* and *kanchet* in the lake than they could when there was still a fishing lot. (The lot owner didn't allow them to plant these crops, but now they can do so freely.) (Phnom Penh)
- The price of **land** around the lake has increased, and businessmen are buying it up quickly as well as filling in parts of the lake. (Phnom Penh)
- The number of **conservation areas** has increased (Mekong area). Conservation areas have been established (coastal zone).

4. Planning for the future: Participants made rudimentary one- and five-year plans for CF activities. Elements of those plans are listed below.

- Facilitate the **organization** and strengthening of CFs (5-year plan, Tonle Sap region).
- Help those CFs that don't yet have **by-laws** to draft them (1-year plan, Mekong area). Develop by-laws, **CF management plans**, and **CF agreements** (5-year plan, Mekong area) Develop plans for management of community fisheries (5-year plan, coastal zone). Help CFs develop by-laws and management plans (1-year plan, Tonle Sap region).
- **Disseminate** the CF by-laws and regulations (Stung Treng). Request funds from MRRF to support awareness raising and dissemination activities in the CF (1 year plan, Phnom Penh).
- Make requests for **signatures** recognizing the CF (1-year plan, Phnom Penh)
- Organize at least one **model CF** in each province (5-year plan, Mekong area)
- Establish additional **conservation areas** (Kompong Chhnang). Improve the conservation areas and release fish seed in them (Kandal). Put up signboards forbidding fishing in the conservation areas (Stung Treng). Request the DoF to issue a decision making Thmor Thom, Koh Damlong, Koh Bay Chor, Voeng Chan, and Kambor deep pools protected areas. (Stung Treng). Make a request to MRRF for support in setting up two conservation areas (1-year plan, Phnom Penh). Establish 3 additional conservation areas (5 year plan, Phnom Penh). Improve conservation areas (1-year plan, Mekong area). Establish conservation areas, put up signboards indicating the CF area and forbidding illegal activities in each CF. (5-year plan, Mekong area) Conduct studies in order to establish conservation areas (1-year plan, coastal zone). Set up and expand conservation areas and plant flooded forest (5-year plan, Tonle Sap region).
- Encourage CF members and outsiders who fish in the CF to make **contributions** to the CF (Kompong Chhnang)
- Organize **networks** at district level and with neighboring provinces. (Kompong Chhnang). Organize commune and district level CF networks (Stung Treng). Organize commune and district CF networks. (5-year plan, Mekong area)
- **Raise awareness** on the impacts of illegal activities (1-year plan, coastal zone). Raise awareness on the importance of fisheries resources (5-year plan, coastal zone).
- Provide **training** on CF management and the fisheries law (1-year plan, Kompong Cham). Organize **exposure visits** to learn from experiences in other places (1-year plan, Kompong Cham). Organize exposure visits to build the capacity of CF committees (Kandal). Make a request to MRRF for capacity building of CF committees (1-year plan, Phnom Penh). Capacity building of CF

- committees and members by: training on management of fisheries resources, conflict resolution, the Fisheries Law, writing reports and plans, administrative work, facilitation, financial management, etc.; organize workshops for sharing experiences; meetings to strengthen working group networks; study tours. (1-year plan, Mekong area). Build the capacity of CF committees and members (5-year plan, Mekong area). Provide training and organize exposure visits (1-year plan, coastal zone). Build the capacity of CF committees and organize exposure visits for CF committees (5-year plan, coastal zone). Provide training to CFs (1-year plan, Tonle Sap region).
- Provide training on **breeding and raising fish** (1-year plan, Kompong Cham) Encourage CF members to raise fish in ponds at family scale, and increase fish seed production according to community needs (5-year plan, Kompong Cham). Set up fish hatcheries in the communities (Kandal) Provide training on fish breeding and raising (Kandal).
 - **Improve** the CF area (1-year plan, Kompong Cham)
 - Plant additional **flooded forest** (5-year plan, Kompong Cham). Plant flooded forest in the CF areas and in the fishing lot (Kandal). Replant flooded forest (5 year plan, Phnom Penh). Improve the CF area and replant flooded forest where necessary (5-year plan, Mekong area)
 - **Dig out** reservoirs where they are becoming shallow (5-year plan, Kompong Cham). Dig out shallow areas of the lake (5 year plan, Phnom Penh)
 - Expand CF **membership** to nearby areas (5-year plan, Kompong Cham)
 - **Cooperate** with all relevant institutions (1-year plan, coastal zone).
 - Strengthen community **enforcement** activities (Kandal). Prevent people from clearing flooded forest (Kandal). Work together with police, local authorities, and Fisheries officials to suppress illegal activities (1 year plan, Phnom Penh). Organize networks for enforcement activities (1-year plan, Mekong area). Strengthen suppression and enforcement activities (1-year plan, Mekong area). Improve enforcement by all relevant institutions (1-year plan, coastal zone).
 - Purchase a **boat** to use in patrolling (5 year plan, Phnom Penh)
 - Put up concrete markers around the CF area to clarify **boundaries** with fishing lots (Kandal). Demarcate boundaries (Stung Treng). Make a request to MRRF and the Fisheries Domain Office for help in demarcating the CF boundary. (1-year plan, Phnom Penh). Define the boundaries of important CF areas (1-year plan, Tonle Sap region) and cooperate in mapping CF areas and demarcating boundaries (5-year plan, Tonle Sap region).
 - Hold **re-elections** for CF committees where committees are not very committed. (Kandal) Hold re-elections in cases where CF committees are inactive (Stung Treng). Re-elections will be held in cases where CF committees are inactive (1-year plan, Mekong area). Organize CFs where necessary, and hold elections in cases where CF committees' terms have expired. (5-year plan, Mekong area) Facilitate elections of CF committees (5-year plan, coastal zone).
 - Provide training on the **Fisheries Law** (Kandal). Disseminate the Fisheries Law (Stung Treng). Push for widespread dissemination of relevant laws through all mechanisms (1-year plan, Mekong area). Disseminate the Fisheries Law, sub-decree, and other relevant legislation (1-year plan, Tonle Sap region).
 - Build an **office** for the CF (5 year plan, Phnom Penh)
 - Establish **tourist sites** (Kompong Chhnang)
 - Seek organizations to provide support for integrated **community development** activities (5 year plan, Phnom Penh). Implement community development

activities (1-year plan, Mekong area). Organize community development networks (1-year plan, Mekong area). Implement integrated development activities (5-year plan, coastal zone).

- Construct weirs so that villagers will have water to **irrigate** their fields (Kandal)
- Dig **ringwells** in villages to provide clean water (Kandal)
- Set up **rice banks** (Kompong Chhnang); expand rice and **cattle banks** (5-year plan, Kompong Cham). Expand cow banks in the communities (Kandal)
- Expand **businesses** selling gillnets and fish hooks, raising goats, and weaving mats. (Kandal) Increase income generation activities (1-year plan, coastal zone). Help people start new income generating activities (5-year plan, Tonle Sap region).
- Collect baseline **data** and set up record books to record fish catches. (1-year plan, Tonle Sap region) Develop mechanisms for data collection. (5-year plan, Tonle Sap region).

During the group presentations, some clarifications were made as follows:

- The CFDU officer from Kompong Chhnang clarified that one big problem that is beyond the provincial Office's capacity to resolve is the military base at Tuol Cheik that is involved in protecting illegal activities. He requested help from the DoF in resolving this problem. HE Nao Thuok responded by saying that the CFDU is already working closely with the provincial Governor, and can ask him to help with this problem.
- A Fisheries officer from Phnom Penh municipality said that by organizing small groups it was easier to provide information to communities and collect reports from them.
- The Fisheries officer from Phnom Penh municipality said that the CF had operated large scale fishing operations with the agreement of the members, using barrages. The Fisheries Office had allowed these operations. If the barrages weren't set up, fish would all leave the CF area.
- A group representative from Stung Treng described experiences organizing networks at district level (meeting once every six months) and commune level (meeting once every three months).
- HE Nao Thuok said that a lot of presentations noted the importance of getting the Sub-Decree on Community Fisheries passed soon. However, the Sub-Decree had reached the Council of Ministers but NGOs complained. Had villagers not thumbprinted a complaint, the sub-decree would have been passed. The same villagers also say they want the sub-decree to be passed soon. He said also that the current most recent draft – the draft that went to the Council of Ministers – can be used temporarily.
- HE Nao Thuok noted that there have been requests for NGOs or CFDU to help CFs; however, if CFs can operate on their own, that is good, because it is more sustainable.
- HE Nao Thuok emphasized again the need for community members to make contributions to support the CFs.
- There was discussion of how the problem in the Tonle Sap area of increased number of fishers will be addressed. Mr. Phem Sea, CFDU of Pursat, said this is very difficult and would be done by expanding other livelihood options, like agriculture.

- HE Nao Thuok asked why, in Pursat, police work closely with CF committees but Fisheries officers do not – why police can go to more remote areas than Fisheries officers can? He said that if the police can go, so can Fisheries officers.
- HE Nao Thuok noted that the presentation by the group from the Tonle Sap region focused a lot on the need for money. He pointed out that money isn't always necessary. If villagers think a meeting is useful, they will come without money. The only reason to give them money is if the meeting is for the benefit of the Fisheries Office, not the villagers.
- There were questions about the expansion of a project in Kandal Province to support selling of fishing gears. The facilitator explained that fishers will buy gears anywhere, regardless of who sells them, and if community members can earn money from selling gears it can help reduce their dependence on fishing.
- One participant pointed out that no one had talked about ghost fishing gears. It was noted then that a special event had been organized in Siem Reap to collect old abandoned gears and destroy them.
- A commune chief from Kompong Cham reiterated a request from the first day that electrofishing gears be considered an illegal weapon, and that laws applying to illegal weapons also be applied to electrofishing gears. Anyone caught with electrofishing gear should be considered a murderer. In the past, if five electrofishing gears were destroyed, six more would take their place. HE Nao Thuok said he would see what could be done about this request, and noted that many electrofishers even kill themselves accidentally. Currently there is still no punishment for hiding electrofishing gears.
- HE Nao Thuok noted that CFs are not themselves an authority, and are not outside the commune councils. They come under the authority of the commune council, even though their role is not mentioned in the Sub-Decree. Article 71 of the draft Fisheries Law gives the commune chief the right to stop illegal activities, and make arrests in the case of ongoing offenses – but they can't collect fines.
- A Commune Chief from Lot #18 in Kandal said that conflict over Boeng Veal Samnap in the lot is due to the fact that this pond used to be used for agriculture for six months of the year, and used by the lot for six months of the year. Now, because the pond doesn't dry out, villagers can only farm half the area. Since 1993, only the lot has benefited from this pond. HE Nao Thuok said that fisheries can be more productive than rice production; it is important to diversify away from rice production. Fish is important. Rice production requires lots of inputs, including fertilizer and other chemicals, and impacts on fish. If everyone only farms rice, they won't survive.
- A CF committee member from the area of former lot #15 in Kompong Chhnang asked that Kompong Cham Fisheries officers organize community fisheries in Batheay District, in the four communes (Trap, Tang Krasang, Me Prey, and Batheay) bordering Chulkiri District of Kompong Chhnang. Many of the mosquito net gears used in Chulkiri are put in by people from these four communes. Mr. Ran, in Trapeang Pum Village, Tang Krasang Commune, is the ringleader. In August, 2004, the CF in Kompong Chhnang destroyed mosquito net gears. Mr. Ran came, to try to get his mosquito net gear back, and said, "I can get permission from the military police, why not from the CF?" HE Nao Thuok asked that Kompong Cham Fisheries officers help out with this request.
- HE Nao Thuok emphasized again that if all community members take turns patrolling, there be no need for patrol boats. There is no need at this point for CF

offices, or uniforms. “Don’t waste money.” Meetings can be held anywhere - an office is not necessary at this stage.

Closing Speech

In his final remarks, Mr. Long Chheang made the following comments:

- CF boundaries should be clearly defined, because currently there are a lot of conflicts between CFs and fishing lots, and between CFs and other CFs.
- Commune chiefs, and CFs, can make arrests, but need to hand offenders over to Fisheries officers.
- CFs should work together with Fisheries officers instead of with the police.
- The idea of treating electrofishing gear as an illegal weapon should be considered, though it means police would have full responsibility for dealing with it.

In his closing remarks, HE Nao Thuok noted that at the end of 2000, when the Prime Minister called for reform, there was almost no knowledge in Cambodia of community fisheries. Since then, we have learned through the process of implementation. There is now a lot of experience in Cambodia, and 375 CFs have been established. In the future, we expect CFs to improve in quality, skills, and leadership. Now, CF development is part of the Government’s rectangular strategy.

He said that many good points had been raised in this workshop, including:

- CF members understand the policy of reform and how to organize CFs.
- Fish populations have increased, and illegal fishing decreased.
- Capacities of CF members and leaders have increased, for example the various CF leaders who now feel confident speaking up, even dare to “educate illegal fishers at their homes.” They are able to organize meetings on their own, are able to make plans, and make requests.
- Membership in community fisheries associations is increasing.

But some problems have been raised:

- There is still inadequate participation by women in CF activities
- Too many authorities are involved in stopping illegal activities
- Sometimes police or CFs collect fees from illegal fishers
- Some CFs set up barrages to block water for use in dry season farming, and to generate income for construction projects.
- One group mentioned the collection of fees from fish buyers.
- Boundaries between CFs and fishing lots are not clear yet on the ground, though they are on maps.

He pointed out some of the recommendations that had been made:

- The sub-decree should be passed as quickly as possible. The DoF tried to do this, but CF members themselves thumbprinted statements to block it.
- People have said that the sub-decree doesn’t give clear rights to commune councils – but the law on commune administration clearly gives them a role. The sub-decree is subsidiary to this law.

- Recommendations have been made for integrated community development; this is good. Development can't just be in one sector only.
- Recommendations have been made to establish conservation areas. Participants from Stung Treng requested the Ministry of Agriculture to recognize deep pools as conservation areas – in fact, all are already conservation areas.
- There were recommendations for study tours inside and outside the country. Some have already been organized, and there will be more.
- There were recommendations for training. More than 700 commune council members have participated in training. Still, training must be ongoing, it can't just be done once.

He added that participants should take the experiences from this workshop to implement, to make CF development more effective. And he asked each province to make a plan for CF development. They should make proposals to the DoF, who will try to help find donors.

In conclusion, he noted that a lot has been achieved in the last four years; some other countries have had 15 years of experience with fisheries co-management. And he said that a similar workshop would be held again next year.

Annex 1. Workshop Agenda

Time	Activities
Day 1	
8:00-8:30	Registration
8:30-8:45	Welcome speech, Mr. Som Nuov, Deputy DoF Director
8:45-9:00	Opening speech, Mr. Nao Thuok, DoF Director
9:00-9:10	Introduction, objectives and agenda of the workshop, by Mr. Chhuon Kimchhea, Natural Resource Planner
9:10-9:40	Presentation on the Lessons Learned from CF management in Fishing Lot no. 13-15, Kg. Chhnang province, by Mr. Chap Piseth (MRRF counterpart), Chief of Provincial Fisheries Office of Kg. Chhnang and CF committee chief
9:40-10:00	Coffee break
10:00-10:30	Presentation on the Lessons Learned for CF management in Fishing Lot no. 18, and Boeung Chunlen reservoir, Kandal province, by Mr. Soun Sothea (MRRF counterpart), Chief of Provincial Fisheries Office of Kandal and CF committee chief
10:30-11:00	Presentation on the lessons learned for CF management in Chroy Chek Reservoir, other CFs in Kg. Cham province, by Ms. Prach Sokunthy (MRRF counterpart), Chief of P. Fisheries Office of Kg. Cham and CF committee chief
11:00-11:30	Presentation on Research guidelines of CF establishment, by Ms. Chan Rotana (CFDO staff)
11:30-12:00	Presentation on the lessons learned from CF management in Boeung Cheung Ek Reservoir, by Mr. Yin Dara (MRRF counterpart), Chief of Fisheries Phnom Penh office and CF committee chief
12:00-14:00	LUNCH
14:00-14:30	Presentation on the lessons learned from CF management in Deep Pool, Stung Treng province, by Mr. Leang Saroeun (MRRF counterpart), Chief of Provincial Fisheries Office of Stung Treng and CF committee chief
14:30-15:00	Presentation on the lessons learned from CF management in Siem Reap province, by Chief of Provincial Fisheries Office
15:00-15:30	Presentation on the lessons learned from CF management in Battambang province, by Chief of Provincial Fisheries Office
15:30-15:45	Coffee break
15:15-16:15	Presentation on the lessons learned from CF management in Banteay Meanchey province, by Chief of Provincial Fisheries Office and a representative of CF
16:15-17:00	Group discussions
Day 2	
8:30-10:00	Group discussions (continued)
10:00-10:15	Coffee break
10:15-12:00	Group discussions (continued)
12:00-14:00	LUNCH
14:00-15:30	Group discussions (continued)
15:30-15:45	Coffee break

15:45-17:00	Group discussions (continued) and preparation of presentations
Day 3	
8:00-10:00	Group presentations
10:00-10:15	Coffee break
10:15-11:00	Continue group presentations and discussion on the differences of lesson, experiences, problems among CF sites and plans.
11:00-11:15	Summary of workshop, by Mr. Ly Vuthy (Chief of CFDO) and Chhuon Kimchhea (Vice chief of CFDO)
11:15-11:30	Closing speech, by DoF Director

Annex 11. Questions for Group Discussions

1. Experiences and recommendations

- 1.1 Have participants share what they have done or seen in practice in the past, and evaluate whether it should or should not be replicated.

Example: Some CFs have operated large scale fishing operations: based on actual experience, has this led to stronger CFs? more sustainable CFs?

Example: Some CFs have fined illegal fishers: based on actual experience, has this led to stronger CFs? Has it led to reduced level of conflict?

Example: Some CFs have used their income to pay for construction projects: based on actual experience, has this led to stronger CFs?

Example: Some CFs have stopped illegal activities themselves: based on actual experience, what has been the result of this?

Example: Some CFs have established conservation areas: based on actual experience, does establishing conservation areas lead to increased fish populations?

- 1.2 Based on past experience, how should strategies be modified or adapted in the future? Please give specific reasons. This is called *adaptive learning*.

Example: "In the future, we should use education more than arrests to stop illegal activities, because in the past, based on actual experience, arresting people led to friction within the CF...."

Example: "In the future, small groups should be organized so that villagers can participate directly. In the past, in big village meetings, most people don't speak up."

- 1.3 What other recommendations have you come up with based on CF development in the past?

- 1.4 Explain: How have you shared your experiences [with CF development] with others in the past?

Example: "We have had shared experiences from one village to another in meetings of the CF federation."

Example: "The commune chief has shared experiences during meetings at the district."

Prepare to present:

- Present all of the recommendations you have come up with based on past experiences in organized CFs, and give specific reasons for them.

2. Monitoring and evaluation: *The important point is for participants to understand the importance of indicators of activities and indicators of impact, and understand the importance of collecting information in order to measure progress against indicators.*

- 2.1 In the past, what information has been collected about the process of organizing CFs? Who has collected the information, and where has the information been sent?

Example: meeting minutes have been kept in the CF document box

Example: Reports on illegal activities are kept in the CF document box and giving to the provincial Fisheries Office, which sends them on to the DoF.

- 2.2 In the future, in order to measure impact or change within the community, what indicators should you use? Please show how you will collect information to measure the indicators.

Example: The price of fish: The CF committee will monitor the market price of fish

Example: Fish species caught within the community: Fishers will record the fish that they catch

Example: The number of villagers who participate in meetings: collect meeting attendance lists

- 2.3 In the future, what documentation do you need to have in order to keep track of implementation of plans of the CF?

Example: Meeting minutes and attendance lists

Example: Records of patrol activities

Example: Reports on exposure visits

- 2.4 Make a plan for monitoring and evaluation, both of implementation of activities (based on collecting documentation) and achieving impact (based on indicators)

- 2.5 In the future, what information should be collected for the benefit of the community? For the benefit of local authorities? For the benefit of Fisheries officers? For the benefit of the facilitators? For the benefit of the DoF?

Prepare to present:

- Present the indicators and means of collecting information to be used in monitoring activities and impact
- Present plans to collect and report on information

- 3. Impact:** What is important is for participants to identify what has changed since CF initiatives began, with regard to knowledge, skills, and attitudes, management of resources, and the condition of the resources.

- 3.1 Since CF development began, what has changed with regards to knowledge, capacities, skills, roles, and attitudes? Give evidence...

Example: Increased solidarity. Specifically, now villagers have help five poor families

Example: People are more confident. Specifically, now they are able to stand up and speak in front of a national workshop.

- 3.2 What has changed with regards to management of resources and the condition of resources since CF development began?

Example: Fish is more abundant. Specifically, before people never caught trey k'ek, now people do; before they used only 2 cm mesh gillnets, now they use 5 cm mesh nets.

Example: Electrocutation of fish has decreased. Specifically, there used to be five electrofishing gears in the village and now there are only 2.

3.3 What else has changed since the beginning of CF development?

Prepare to present:

- Show what has changed since the beginning of CF development.

4. Planning: What is important is for participants to identify problems that they are encountering and ways to address them, and come up with plans for the future.

4.1 Currently, what problems or obstacles are the CFs encountering?

4.2 What needs to be done to address those problems or needs?

Example: Organize a network from one village to the next, one commune to the next, one district to the next

Example: Organize federations

4.3 Identify strategies and plan activities for the year 2005, and for the next five years (2005-2010) in order to expand and strengthen CFs, and ensure their sustainability.

Prepare to present:

- Present the one-year and five-year plans.